

Evidence Analysis of John Robert Dyer's Birth

Research Question & Background

When and where was John Robert Dyer born? He married Barsheba Thorpe in about 1830, probably in Tennessee, and resided in Hawkins County, Tennessee from 1830-1870. He died 19 December 1879 in Hawkins County, Tennessee.

John Robert Dyer often went by his middle name, Robert. His parents are unknown. Several theories have been shared in online trees but have not met the GPS. I'm currently using DNA evidence to find his parents. One authored source and several original sources give conflicting direct evidence for John Robert Dyer's birthdate and place.

Nancy DeWitt's Narrative

A biographical sketch of John Robert Dyer and his wife, Barsheba Tharp, was written by their great-granddaughter, Nancy Mildred (Beals) DeWitt. In this article, Nancy states the following about John Robert Dyer's origins in the first paragraph: "The latest research I can find shows John Robert Dyer was probably born in Greensboro, N. Carolina between 1813-1818 and Barsheba Tharpe was born on 8 Sept. 1813. We think her father's name was John or Robert Lewis Tharpe but we are not positive. We think his mother's name was Sarah or Sara Taylor."¹

| Birth Information | Source | Information | Evidence |
|---------------------------|----------|-------------|----------|
| 1813-1818, Greensboro, NC | Authored | Secondary | Direct |

- Source: Nancy's narrative is an authored source, combining information from undocumented sources, much of it likely oral tradition. The document is undated but was probably written during Nancy's adult life, sometime between 1943-2009. The text was uploaded to the FamilySearch Family Tree and shared by user LindaCroy1 on 10 April 2016. LindaCroy1 is also a DNA match to my father-in-law, and apparently a descendant of Nancy. Nancy does not cite the sources of information in her narrative.
- Information: Nancy gave secondary information. She was apparently sharing her latest research or the research of others when she gave the birth date range of 1813-1818 and the birthplace of Greensboro, North Carolina for John Robert Dyer. The information about John Robert Dyer's birth is secondary information. Nancy states the information provided about Robert's birth is just a hypothesis or theory with her use of the qualifier "probably." The fact

¹ Nancy Mildred (Beals) DeWitt (1923-2009), "John Robert Dyer and Barsheba Tharpe: Valley of The Terrapins, Slow and Steady Wins the Race," undated; article online, contributed by user LindaCroy1, 10 April 2016, attached to John Robert Dyer (LZKV-1TV), "Family Tree," FamilySearch (<https://www.familysearch.org> : accessed 23 Apr 2020).

that she is sharing the latest research she could find shows that she is not sharing her own personal knowledge of a family story, but the research of others.

- Evidence: These paragraphs provide direct evidence for Robert's birth date and place. The information answers the research question directly.

Nancy DeWitt's Narrative, Paragraph 44

Nancy's narrative later discusses John Robert Dyer's death and age at death in paragraph 44:

In about 1869, Grandpa Dyer got what they thought was rheumatism. He was so bad that my Grandmother Elizabeth and Aunt Polly used to take turns going over and taking care of him at night. He was bedfast for 10 years before he died on the 19 of December 1879. He was only 66 years old. He is buried in the Dyer graveyard there on the hill overlooking his little Terrapin Valley.

Using the date 19 December 1879 and the age of 66 years, a calculated birth year range for Robert is 19 Dec 1812 - 18 Dec 1813.

| Birth Information | Source | Information | Evidence |
|---------------------------|---------------|--------------------|-----------------|
| 19 Dec 1812 - 18 Dec 1813 | Authored | Secondary | Direct |

Evidence

Although the birth date is calculated from Robert's age at death, this is still direct evidence. It is relevant to the research question and it directly addresses the issue.

Information

The statement that John Robert Dyer was 66 years old when he died sounds more authoritative than Nancy's earlier estimate that he was born about 1813-1818. If John Robert Dyer was 66 years old when he died in 1879, he was born in 1812-1813, not 1813-1818. This internal conflict within Nancy's narrative seems to indicate that she had been told that Robert was 66 years old when he died but her research (or the research of others) found other possible birth dates.

The story that Robert died when he was "only" 66 years old may indicate that the family was disappointed he died at this age. The narrative goes on to talk about Robert's widow Barsheba and the four youngest children being taught by missionaries from the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. They accepted baptism and moved to Colorado and Arizona. Nancy (Beals) DeWitt descends from one of these younger four children, Elizabeth Frances (Dyer) Beals. The end of the narrative gives a sense that Robert missed an important part of the family's story by dying when he was "only 66" years old.

Nancy was the youngest of 6 children of Charles Mitchell Beals, who was the son of Elizabeth Frances Dyer. Elizabeth lived until 1928. Nancy was born in 1923. Nancy would only have known her grandmother until she was 5 years old. Nancy's informant was almost certainly her father, Charles Mitchell Beals, or maybe one of her aunts or uncles.

Nancy mentioned that John Robert Dyer was buried in "the Dyer graveyard there on the hill overlooking his little Terrapin Valley." This indicates that she or her informant was familiar with the Dyer graveyard. No image of a headstone has been found online for Robert, but it is possible that one exists. A headstone photo for his son, Augustus Washington Dyer, is the only photo for the Dyer Family Cemetery in Hawkins County, Tennessee at Find a Grave.² The headstone is laying in the grass, as if it has fallen over. It's possible that no headstone was erected at the time of Robert's death, or that the cemetery fell into disrepair and it was damaged or lost. If there were a headstone created at or near the time of Robert's death, it could corroborate the oral tradition that Robert was 66 years old at his death.

1880 Census - Mortality Schedule

The 1880 mortality schedule asked for the names of those who had died during the year ending May 3, 1880. The schedule for Hawkins County stated that Robert died in December 1879, at age 70, and that he was a resident of Hawkins County for 70 years (his entire life).³ The doctor who attended his death was D.D. Biritton. He died of Rheumatism / C[ultis?]. His occupation was farmer and he was married at the time of his death. Calculating 70 years back in time from 1 December 1879 and 30 December 1879 gives the range of 1 Dec 1808 to 30 Dec 1809 for Robert's birthdate.

| Birth Information | Source | Information | Evidence |
|--|-------------------------------|------------------------------------|----------|
| 1 Dec 1808 to 30 Dec 1809 in Hawkins County, TN | Image copy of the original | Undetermined - likely Secondary | Direct |

Source

In 1880, the U.S. Census Office ordered the creation of one original and one short form copy of the census returns. The original was sent to the federal census office and the short form copy was kept at the county courthouse.⁴ After the originals were microfilmed, the Census Bureau sent the originals back to any state archives that would take them. The mortality schedule that I viewed was the original microfilmed by NARA, digitized and viewed online at Ancestry. The filming was done with good light and contrast and is legible.

The penmanship of the enumerator was neat and without corrections or changes. The 1880 census instructions state that enumerators should take care in filling in the schedules without "interlineations, erasures, or blots, inasmuch as no copy of the schedules is provided to be made by the existing census law, and the original schedules are to be returned to the census office at

² Find a Grave, database and images (<https://www.findagrave.com/memorial/70365315> : accessed 23 April 2020), memorial page and headstone photo for Augustus Washington Dyer (13 Dec 1831–8 Sep 1907), Find a Grave Memorial no. 70365315, citing Dyer Family Cemetery, Hawkins County, Tennessee, USA, maintained by Fran (contributor 47001337).

³ 1880 U.S. Census, Hawkins County, Tennessee, Mortality Schedule, 4th District, p. 999 (penned), line 10, family 171, John R. Dyer, died Dec 1879; image, Ancestry (https://www.ancestry.com/interactive/8756/TNT655_29-0115 : accessed 23 Apr 2020); citing National Archives publication T655, roll 29.

⁴ Bill Dollarhide, "The 1880 Census Short Forms & Where to Find Them," 15 January 2019, GenealogyBlog (<https://www.genealogyblog.com/?p=41858> : accessed 24 Apr 2020).

Washington for examination and compilation."⁵ An illegible note was overwritten the original sheet on the column for cause of death a few rows before Robert's row. A clerk later added numbers on the cause of death column. Part of the cause of death after rheumatism for Robert is illegible. The scribe ran out of space and was trying to squeeze in a secondary cause of death that appears as C[ultis?].

Information

The informant is unknown, but was probably his grieving widow, Barsheba. Other possible informants include two of Barsheba's children who were living at home: Eliza J. Dyer, age 35, James Dyer, age 28. The older children living nearby could have been the informant as well. The mortality schedule was taken in the summer of 1880, so only about 6 months had passed since Robert died. His wife and children were reliable informants for the date their father died. They were eyewitnesses whose information was recorded soon after the death. They were not eyewitnesses to Robert's birth. The age they heard their father give during his life was hearsay. Robert was not even a primary informant for his birth date, being an infant with no memory of the event. So, the age at death information on the mortality schedule is almost certainly secondary and may be inaccurate.

Evidence

This record provides direct evidence that John Robert Dyer was born within the range of 1 Dec 1808 to 30 Dec 1809 in Hawkins County, Tennessee. The information of Robert's age at death addresses the question of his birthdate. The information that he lived in the same county his whole life answers the question of where he was born.

1870 Census

John R. Dyer was age 52 on the 1870 census.⁶ The census date was 1 June 1870, and persons were asked for their age on that date. If John R. Dyer was age 52 on 1 June 1870, he was born between 2 June 1817 to 1 June 1818. The census states John R. Dyer was born in North Carolina.

| Birth Information | Source | Information | Evidence |
|--|------------------------------------|---------------------------------|----------|
| 2 June 1817 to 1 June 1818 in North Carolina | Image copy of a duplicate original | Undetermined - likely Secondary | Direct |

- Source: The Federal copy of the 1870 census is a duplicate original. The census act of 1850, which applied to the census from 1850-1870, stated that "each assistant shall...furnish the original census returns to the clerk of the county court of their respective counties, and two copies, duly compared and corrected, to the marshal of the district."⁷ The original was for display at the county courthouse, with one copy to be sent to the state, and another copy to be sent to Washington. These are called duplicate originals, being created simultaneously by

⁵ United States Department of Interior, Census Office, 1880 Census Instructions, United States Census Bureau (<https://www.census.gov/history/pdf/1880enumerator-instructions.pdf> : accessed 24 Apr 2020).

⁶ 1870 U.S. Census, Hawkins County, Tennessee, population schedule, 4th District, p. 35 (stamped), dwelling 30, family 30, John R. Dyer; image, FamilySearch (<https://www.familysearch.org>: accessed 23 Apr 2020); citing national Archives publication M593, Roll 1535.

⁷ United States Congress, Census Act of 1850, 8 23 May 1850, United States Census Bureau (https://www.census.gov/history/pdf/1850_Census_Act.pdf : accessed 24 Apr 2020).

the same enumerator, supposedly with the exact same information.⁸ As with all copying, some errors were likely introduced, as found by Harry Hollingsworth in his comparison of Federal and State copies.⁹ Some darkness toward the top of the image copy makes it difficult to read the preprinted form. The page is stamped with a U.S. Census Office stamp. Assistant Marshal Smith E. Mooney had a legible hand and wrote carefully.

- Information: The enumerator was supposed to talk to the head of household, John R. Dyer, however it could have been his wife or one of the children if he was indisposed or absent. Nancy DeWitt's narrative said that Robert was taken ill with rheumatism in 1869 and that it was bad enough that his daughters came over to take care of him at night. If this was the case, he may not have been the informant for the 1870 census. It could have been his wife, Barshaba, or children Eliza, age 25, Charles, age 21, of John J., age 19.
- Evidence: The information is direct evidence that Robert was born in 2 June 1817 to 1 June 1818 in North Carolina.

1860 Census

John R. Dyer was age 50 on the 1860 Census in Hawkins, Tennessee.¹⁰ Using the census date of June 1, his birth year range is calculated to be 2 June 1809 - 1 June 1810.

| Birth Information | Source | Information | Evidence |
|--|------------------------------------|---------------------------------|----------|
| 2 June 1809 - 1 June 1810 in Tennessee | Image copy of a duplicate original | Undetermined - likely Secondary | Direct |

- Source: The federal copy of the 1860 census was a duplicate original, as discussed earlier. This copy may have had errors but was checked with the original to be as an exact copy as possible. The handwriting was consistent and legible. The image copy has good lighting and contrast.
- Information: The informant is indeterminable but was probably the head of household, John R. Dyer, or his wife, Barsha.
- Evidence: This is direct evidence that Robert was born 2 June 1809 - 1 June 1810 in Tennessee. The information addresses the research question.

⁸ Elizabeth Shown Mills, *Evidence Explained: Citing History Sources from Artifacts to Cyberspace*, 3rd ed., (Baltimore: Genealogical, 2015) 29-30.

⁹ Bill Dollarhide, "Are You Reading the Originals," 4 January 2013, GenealogyBlog (<https://www.genealogyblog.com/?p=24002> : accessed 24 Apr 2020). Toward the end of the article, Dollarhide discusses Hollingsworth's work comparing Federal and State copies.

¹⁰ 1860 U.S. Census, Hawkins County, Tennessee, population schedule, 4th District, p. 185, dwelling 1321, family 1245, John R. Dyer; image, FamilySearch, (<https://www.familysearch.org>: accessed 23 Apr 2020); citing National Archives publication M635 Roll 1255.

1850 Census

The 1850 Census reports Robert's age as 37 and his birthplace as Tennessee.¹¹ Using the census date of June 1, his birth year range is calculated to be 1 June 1812 to 31 May 1813.

| Birth Information | Source | Information | Evidence |
|---|------------------------------------|---------------------------------|----------|
| 1 June 1812 to 31 May 1813 in Tennessee | Image copy of a duplicate original | Undetermined - likely Secondary | Direct |

- Source: The 1850 census is a duplicate original with possible copying errors by the assistant marshal from the original. The image copy is slightly overexposed with a bright section on the side middle and a darker section toward the bottom where Robert's family was enumerated. The contrast is good enough that the writing is still legible. The handwriting is neat. The marshal made a correction for another person on the page, Richard Holic, changing his birthplace from Ten. to N.C. This could indicate that the assistant marshal followed the census instructions and reviewed the information given by the families with them before he left their home and made corrections. It could also indicate that he checked the duplicate copies with the originals carefully before sending them to his supervisor for errors.
- Information: The informant is undetermined but probably the head of household, Robert.
- Evidence: This is direct evidence that Robert was born between 1 June 1812 and 31 May 1813 in Tennessee. The information answers the research question directly.

1840 Census

Robert was probably the 20-30 year old male in his household in the 1840 Census.¹² This makes his birth date range 2 June 1809 - 1 June 1820. No place of birth was given in the 1840 census.

| Birth Information | Source | Information | Evidence |
|---------------------------|------------------------------------|---------------------------------|----------|
| 2 June 1809 - 1 June 1820 | Image copy of a duplicate original | Undetermined - likely Secondary | Direct |

- Source: The U.S. Marshals created a copy of their work and sent it to Washington. The original was kept by the office of the District Court of each state.¹³
- Information: The informant is unknown, but was probably the head of household.
- Evidence: This is direct evidence that Robert was born between 2 June 1809 - 1 June 1820.

¹¹ 1850 U.S. Census, Hawkins County, Tennessee, population schedule, District No. 15, p. 864 (penned), dwelling 91, family 91, Robert Dyer; image, FamilySearch (<https://www.familysearch.org> : accessed 23 Apr 2020); citing National Archives publication M432, roll 882.

¹² 1840 U.S. Census, Hawkins County, Tennessee, p. 66 (penned), line 17, Robert Dyer; image, FamilySearch (<https://familysearch.org> : accessed 24 Apr 2020); citing National Archives publication M704, roll 526.

¹³ Bill Dollarhide, "Are You Reading the Originals," 4 January 2013, GenealogyBlog (<https://www.genealogyblog.com/?p=24002> : accessed 24 Apr 2020).

1830 Census

Robert's household in 1830 included just one male 15-20 and 1 female 10-15.¹⁴ The census date was June 1, 1830, giving a birth date range of 2 June 1809 to 1 June 1815.

| Birth Information | Source | Information | Evidence |
|----------------------------|------------------------------------|---------------------------------|----------|
| 2 June 1809 to 1 June 1815 | Image copy of a duplicate original | Undetermined - likely Secondary | Direct |

- Source: duplicate original, digital image of the microfilm
- Information: Undetermined, but the informant was probably Robert, as the head of household. He was an infant at his birth and doesn't remember when it occurred. However he was only age 15-20 at the time of this census, so he probably knew his own age pretty well as a teen/young adult where each year of experience and physical growth added to his identity.
- Evidence: Direct evidence that Robert was born 2 June 1809 to 1 June 1815. The age range directly answers the research question.

Marriage

An 1863 Courthouse fire destroyed many Hawkins County records, including marriages, wills and probate files, court records, deeds, and tax records. Some of these records still remain, but the collections should not be considered complete.¹⁵ No marriage record has been located for John Robert Dyer and Barsheba Tharp. This is likely due to record loss in Hawkins County. However it appears that they married at a young age, when Barsheba was age 10-15 and Robert was age 15-20.¹⁶ Their first child, Augustus, was born 12 December 1831.¹⁷ This information provides indirect evidence that Robert was old enough to be married and have children by 1831. If he was at least 16 years old by the 1830 census when he and Barsheba were apparently living together, he was probably not born after 1814.

Tax Records

Robert Dyer appears on the 1836 Tax List of Hawkins County, Tennessee, in District 15.¹⁸ He was taxed for 1 white poll and no land. Tennessee law required each white male between 21-50 years of

¹⁴ 1830 U.S. census, Hawkins County, Tennessee, p. 22 (penned), line 5, Robert Dyer; image, FamilySearch (<https://www.familysearch.org> : accessed 23 Apr 2020); citing National Archives microfilm publication M19, roll 178.

¹⁵ "Lost Records: Courthouse Fires and Disasters in Tennessee," Tennessee Secretary of State (<https://sos.tn.gov> : accessed 8 Dec 2018).

¹⁶ 1830 U.S. census, Hawkins County, Tennessee, p. 22 (penned), line 5, Robert Dyer.

¹⁷ Find a Grave, headstone photo for Augustus Washington Dyer (13 Dec 1831–8 Sep 1907).

¹⁸ Hawkins County, Tennessee, 1836 Tax List, District No. 15, p. 544, line 6, Robert Dyer; Tennessee, Early Tax List Records, 1783-1895, database with images online, Ancestry (<https://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 10 December 2018); citing Early Tax Lists of Tennessee. Microfilm, 12 rolls, The Tennessee State Library and Archives, Nashville, Tennessee.

age pay the poll tax.¹⁹ This original record gives indirect evidence that Robert was born between 1786-1815. Robert was the informant for his age. He was told by whoever raised him when he was born, but does not remember his own birth, so his act of paying a poll tax supplies secondary information. Some genealogists use a person's knowledge of their own age as primary information, which I can understand as well. The evidence is indirect because the tax list does not ask for age or report birth information. It does not directly address the question of when Robert was born.

Correlation

Table 1 below shows the various dates and places for Robert's birth. Information from the 1870 census is an outlier and is highlighted red. Robert was ill with rheumatism and probably was not the informant. If the 1870 census is right, Robert was born in 1817-1818, he would have only been 13-14 years old when his first son was born in 1831. This is an unlikely situation. Robert would not have paid taxes in 1836 if he was born in 1817-1818, because he would have been only 18-19 years old. Nancy's birth year range going to 1818 is also an outlier because she was likely basing it on the 1870 census. The 1880 mortality schedule is also an outlier. It was at least third hand information and does not agree with Robert's earliest known record of age on the 1830 census. The most likely date range for Robert's birth is 1810-1813.

Table 1: John Robert Dyer Birth Information Comparison

| Record Date | Date of Birth | Birth Place | Age | Source (cited above) |
|-------------|---------------|-----------------|-------------|---------------------------------------|
| 1830 | 1810-1815 | -- | 15-20 | 1830 U.S. Census, Population Schedule |
| 1836 | 1786-1815 | -- | 21-50 | 1836 Tennessee Tax List |
| 1840 | 1810-1820 | -- | 20-30 | 1840 U.S. Census, Population Schedule |
| 1850 | 1813 | Tennessee | 37 | 1850 U.S. Census, Population Schedule |
| 1860 | 1810 | Tennessee | 50 | 1860 U.S. Census, Population Schedule |
| 1870 | 1817-1818 | North Carolina | 52 | 1870 U.S. Census, Population Schedule |
| 1880 | 1809 | Hawkins Co., TN | 70 at death | 1880 U.S. Census, Mortality Schedule |
| 1980-2009 | 1813 | -- | 66 at death | Nancy DeWitt narrative |
| 1980-2009 | 1813-1818 | Greensboro, NC | -- | Nancy DeWitt narrative |

Tables 2-4 show his children's agreement that he was born in Tennessee. The only outlier is the information from Augustus and Richard that their father was born in North Carolina. As next door neighbors, it's possible the same informant gave faulty information for both households, or they had

¹⁹ R.L. Caruthers & A.O.P. Nicholson, *A Compilation of the Statutes of Tennessee of a General and Permanent Nature* (Nashville: James Smith, 1836) 603; images, Google Books (<https://google.com/books> : accessed 24 Apr 2020).

agreed upon this information while giving it. There may have been oral tradition that Robert's parents came from North Carolina that crept into their memory of where Robert was born.

Table 2: John Robert Dyer Birthplace from Children's 1880 Census Records

Information from the following original records of federal census enumerations capture direct evidence for the place John Robert Dyer was born. However the information is all secondary.

| Name | Father's Birthplace | Source | Primary or Secondary Information |
|------------------------------|---------------------|--|---|
| Augustus Dyer | Tennessee | 1880 U.S. Census, Hawkins, TN, pop. sch., District 4, ED 77, p. 209B, dwell. 176, fam. 181, Augustus Dyer household; National Archives publication T9, roll 1260. | Augustus, as head, was probably the informant - secondary info, he was not an eyewitness.. Siblings in separate households nearby all agree that their father was born in Tennessee. |
| Mary [Dyer] Luster | Tennessee | 1880 U.S. Census, Hawkins, TN, pop. sch., District 4, ED 77, p. 209B, dwell.173, fam. 178, Mary Luster in William Luster household; National Archives publication T9, roll 1260. | Mary or her husband, William, were probably the informants, neither were eyewitnesses. Secondary information. |
| Richard | Tennessee | 1880 U.S. Census, Hawkins, TN, pop. sch., District 4, ED 77, p. 209B, dwell.174, fam. 179, Richard Dyer household; National Archives publication T9, roll 1260. | Richard, as head of house, was probably the informant. He was not an eyewitness, the information is secondary. |
| Charley Dyer | Tennessee | 1880 U.S. Census, Hawkins, TN, pop. sch., District 4, ED 77, p. 209B, dwell.175, fam. 180, Charley Dyer household; National Archives publication T9, roll 1260. | Charley Dyer as head of house was probably the informant, he was not an eyewitness to his father's birth, the information is secondary. |
| Eliza J. Dyer and James Dyer | Tennessee | 1880 U.S. Census, Hawkins, TN, pop. sch., District 4, ED 77, p. 209A, dwell. 166, fam. 171, Eliza J. Dyer in Barchebe Dyer household; National Archives publication T9, roll 1260. | The informant was probably Barchebe. Although she was not an eyewitness to her deceased husband's birth, she is probably a more reliable informant than her children, having known her husband from 1830 until his death in 1879. She would have been more intimately acquainted with his birthplace and origins. |
| Elizabeth [Dyer] Bailes | Tennessee | 1880 U.S. Census, Hawkins, TN, pop. sch., District 4, ED 77, p. 209A, dwell. 167, fam. 172, Elizabeth Bailes in John S. Bailes household; National Archives publication T9, roll 1260. | The informant was probably John or Elizabeth who were not eyewitnesses- secondary information. |

Table 3: John Robert Dyer Birthplace from Children's 1900 Census Records

The following is direct evidence and secondary information from original census records.

| Name | Father's Birthplace | Source | Primary or Secondary Information |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|---|--|
| Augustus W. Dyer | North Carolina | 1900 U.S. Census, Hawkins, TN, pop. sch., New Hope, ED 79, p. 14A, dwell. 245, fam. 242, Augustus Dyer household; National Archives publication T623, roll 1577. | Augustus was probably the informant giving secondary information about his father's birthplace. He was older now. 20 years had passed since the 1880 census where he and all his siblings reported that their father was born in TN. |
| Richard F. Dyer | North Carolina | 1900 U.S. Census, Hawkins, TN, pop. sch., New Hope, ED 79, p. 14A, dwell. 244, fam. 246, Richard Dyer household; National Archives publication T623, roll 1577. | Richard lived next door to Augustus. Richard or his wife probably gave the secondary information about Richard's father's birthplace. Richard and Augustus may have agreed together that their father was born in N.C. during the enumeration. |
| Polly Luster and Lewis Dyer | Tennessee | 1900 U.S. Census, Hawkins, TN, pop. sch., New Hope, ED 79, p. 15A, dwell. 261, fam. 263, Polly Luster household; National Archives publication T623, roll 1577. | Mary "Polly" (Dyer) Luster was the head of house and her brother Lewis Dyer was living with her. She was probably the informant for both of their father's birthplace entries. She lived only a few houses away from Augustus and Richard, yet she reported her father's birthplace as TN. |
| Elizabeth Beals | Tennessee | 1900 U.S. Census, Graham, AZ, pop. sch., Safford, ED 21, p. 39B, fam. 687, Elizabeth Beals in John S. Beals household; National Archives publication T623, roll 45. | John was probably the informant for his wife's father's birthplace. It could also have been Elizabeth. The information is secondary either way. |
| Charles M. Dyer | Tennessee | 1900 U.S. Census, Graham, AZ, pop. sch., Safford, ED 21, p. 34A, fam. 596, Charles M. Dyer household; National Archives publication T623, roll 45. | Charles or his wife were the only two people in the household and were likely the informants. The information is secondary. |

Table 4: John Robert Dyer Birthplace from Children's Death Certificates

Only two death certificates exist for children of John Robert Dyer. While they provide direct evidence, the information is secondary.

| Name | Father's Birthplace | Record Date | Informant | Source |
|-----------------|---------------------|-------------|-------------|---|
| Richard F. Dyer | Tenn | 1921 | Bob Luster | "Tennessee Deaths, 1914-1966," database with images, FamilySearch (https://familysearch.org), Richard F. Dyer, 3 Feb 1921; citing Tennessee State Library and Archives, Nashville. |
| Lewis Dyer | Unknown | 1916 | J.C. Luster | "Tennessee Deaths, 1914-1966," database with images, FamilySearch (https://familysearch.org), Lewis T. Dyer, 14 Apr 1916; citing Tennessee State Library and Archives, Nashville. |