

**EVIDENCE ANALYSIS PROJECT  
APRIL 25, 2020**

**PREPARED FOR**

ProGen 46 Wednesday 1:00 Study Group

**RESEARCH OBJECTIVE**

Determine the vital events for Augusta Lehman who was born in about 1877, in New York, to Gottlieb Lehmann and Pauline Lux.

**SCOPE & LIMITATIONS**

The focus of this project is to assess the quality of evidence relative to the research objective. Proof statements, proof summaries and proof arguments are outside the scope of this report.

The length of this project is limited to ten pages; therefore, certain images and extracts are not included in order to save space. Citations, however, are included for all sources.

**BACKGROUND**

Research on Augusta Lehman is part of two larger projects. The first project is a Family Group Study for Gottlieb Lehman and Pauline Lux, the researcher's 2<sup>nd</sup> Great Grandparents<sup>1</sup>. In the 1880 U.S. census, Augusta was identified as one of their daughters and is included in the project.

The second project<sup>2</sup> is a quest to identify the nature of a misattributed parentage event for [a relative who is a close DNA match to the researcher]<sup>3</sup>. Augusta Lehman is among many candidates for the mother of [the DNA match's grandmother]. In order to analyze the possibility, if any, of Augusta's parenthood it is important to define the time and place of her vital events.

**SUMMARY OF EVIDENCE**

Augusta Lehman's vital events are as follows:

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| Born    | 28 August 1876 in New York, New York<br>to Gottlieb Lehman and Pauline Lux |
| Married | August 1895 in Porter County, Indiana<br>to Frank Schwartz                 |
| Died    | 18 September 1914 in Valparaiso, Indiana                                   |

---

<sup>1</sup> "Lehman Lux Family Group," Lorraine Blanton private research files (West Hills, CA).

<sup>2</sup> "[A relative who is a close DNA match to the researcher] Research Project," Lorraine Blanton private research files (West Hills, CA)

<sup>3</sup> Living individual's names are redacted throughout this report.

## ANALYSIS OF EVIDENCE

| Event  | Source            | Analysis  |
|--|-------------------|---|
|  |                   | Reliability    Source    Information    Evidence                                  |
| <b>Date of Birth</b>   |                   |   |
| 1876/1877  | 1880 census       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| 28 Aug 1876  | Birth certificate | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| 28 Aug 1876  | Christening index | Unknown reliability, derivative source, undetermined information, direct evidence |
| 1876   | Marriage license  | Unreliable, original source, primary info, direct evidence                        |
| 28 Aug 1876  | Death certificate | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Aug 1876   | 1900 census       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| 1877/1878  | 1910 census       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| With the slight exception of the 1910 census, these sources agree that Augusta was born 28 Aug 1876. As further confirmation, church records for New York City should be checked for birth and baptism information that may, or may not, support this date.  |                   |   |
| <b>Place of Birth</b>  |                   |   |
| New York   | 1880 census       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| New York, New York   | Birth certificate | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Manhattan, New York, New York  | Christening index | Unknown reliability, derivative source, undetermined information, direct evidence |
| New York   | Death certificate | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| New York   | 1900 census       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| New York   | 1910 census       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| These sources agree that Augusta was born in New York City. As further confirmation, church records for New York City should be checked for birth and baptism information that may support this location.  |                   |   |
| <b>Date of Marriage</b>  |                   |   |
| 27 Oct 1895 or after   | Marriage license  | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| 30 Oct 1895  | Marriage return   | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| 1895/1896  | 1900 census       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| 1895/1896  | 1910 census       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| 28 Oct 1895  | Frank's obituary  | Reliable, narrative, secondary information, direct evidence                       |
| These sources indicate a difference in the exact date of Augusta and Frank's marriage. Although they only conflict by a couple of days, church records for Wanatah, Indiana (Augusta's home town) and Valparaiso, Indiana (Frank's home town) may provide clarification. Newspaper announcements should be searched as well. |                   |   |
| <b>Place of Marriage</b>   |                   |   |
| Porter County, Indiana   | Marriage license  | Reliable, original source, primary info, indirect evidence                        |
| No direct evidence pinpoints the location of Augusta and Frank's marriage. Church records for Wanatah, Indiana and Valparaiso, Indiana may provide more information as well as, perhaps, a newspaper announcement.   |                   |   |
| <b>Date of Death</b>   |                   |   |
| 18 Sep 1914  | Death certificate | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| 18 Sep 1914  | Frank's obituary  | Reliable, narrative, primary information, direct evidence                         |
| Before 1920  | 1920 census       | Unreliable, original source, primary info, indirect evidence                      |

|  |                         |   |
|--|-------------------------|---|
| After 4 Oct 1911   | Gottlieb's will         | Reliable, derivative source, primary info, indirect evidence                      |
| Before 2 Mar 1915  | Gottlieb's will – notes | Reliable, derivative source, primary info, indirect evidence                      |
| <p>Strong evidence, Augusta's death certificate, indicates that she died 18 Sep 1914. However, more evidence is needed to substantiate this date. Her death certificate shows she was buried at Graceland Cemetery in Valparaiso, but she does not appear in searches at Find A Grave or Billion Graves. (Nor does Frank who was reported to be buried there as well.) Graceland Cemetery should be contacted for more information about Augusta's death. Additionally, local Valparaiso newspapers were searched for Augusta's obituary with no luck. Further searches for newspaper accounts of her death should be undertaken. Again, Valparaiso church records should also be searched for records of her death.</p> |                         |   |
| <b>Place of Death</b>  |                         |   |
| Valparaiso, Porter, Indiana  | Death certificate       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| <p>As with Augusta's date of death, her place of death is strongly identified as Valparaiso, Porter County, Indiana. However, this is the only piece of evidence found so far with this information. The same additional research should be undertaken for her place of death as the research needed for her date of death.</p>  |                         |   |
| <b>Name</b>  |                         |   |
| Auguste Lehman   | 1880 census             | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Auguste Lehmann  | Birth certificate       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Auguste Lehmann  | Christening index       | Unknown reliability, derivative source, undetermined info, direct evidence        |
| Augusta C. Lehman  | Marriage license        | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Augusta Schwartz   | Death Certificate       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Augusta Schwartz   | 1900 census             | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Augusta Schwartz   | 1910 census             | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Augusta Schwartz   | Gottlieb's will         | Reliable, derivative source, primary info, direct evidence                        |
| Augusta Schwartz   | Gottlieb's will - notes | Reliable, derivative source, primary info, direct evidence                        |
| <p>Aside from cultural spelling differences between Auguste and Augusta, and Lehmann and Lehman, Augusta is certainly the same individual recorded in each of these sources.</p>   |                         |   |
| <b>Parents' Names</b>  |                         |   |
| Gottlieb & Pauline Lehman  | 1880 census             | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Gottlieb & Pauline Lux Lehman  | Birth certificate       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Gottlieb Lehman & Pauline Lux  | Christening index       | Unknown reliability, derivative source, undetermined information, direct evidence |
| Gottlieb Lehman & Pauline Lux  | Death certificate       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Gottlieb Lehman  | Gottlieb's will         | Reliable, derivative source, primary info, direct evidence                        |
| <p>Sources agree that Augusta's parents were Gottlieb Lehman and Pauline Lux Lehman.</p>   |                         |   |
| <b>Husband's Name</b>  |                         |   |
| Frank Schwartz   | Marriage license        | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Frank Schwartz   | Death certificate       | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Frank Schwartz   | 1900 census             | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Frank Schwartz   | 1910 census             | Reliable, original source, primary information, direct evidence                   |
| Frank Schwartz   | Frank's obituary        | Reliable, narrative, secondary information, direct evidence                       |
| <p>Sources agree that Augusta's husband was Frank Schwartz.</p>  |                         |   |

## EVIDENCE ON HAND

### 1880 United States Federal census – Gottlieb Lehman household

**Citation:**

1880 U.S. census, La Porte County, Indiana, Schedule 1. –Inhabitants, Cass Township, Enumeration District (ED) 97, p. 24 (written), dwelling 212, family 213, Lehman, Gottlieb household; image *Ancestry.com* (<https://www.ancestry.com> : viewed 1 Apr 2020); citing NARA microfilm T9 roll 292.

**Quality of Evidence:**

|             |          |  |
|-------------|----------|--|
| Source      | Original | This is an image of an original, or image of a duplicate original (counterpart), of the census sheet.<br>Quality is very good except that 'Auguste' is a bit faint, and the penmanship is legible.                                 |
| Informant   | Parent   | The informant was likely to be one of Augusta's parents.   |
| Information | Primary  | If one of Augusta's parents was the informant, they would have primary knowledge about her vital information.  |
| Reliability | Reliable | This census is probably a reliable source. One of Augusta's parents was likely to be the informant, and this census took place about three years after her birth when the information would have been fresh in her parents' minds. |
| Evidence    | Direct   | Parents - Gottlieb & Pauline Lehman<br>Birth Year – 1876/1877 (based on age=3years)<br>Birth Place - New York  |

## EVIDENCE DETAILS

### VITAL RECORDS

#### Birth certificate – Auguste Lehmann

**Citation:**

New York Bureau of Vital Statistics, Health Department, birth return no. 189963 (stamped), 28 Aug 1876, for Auguste Lehmann; image, *New York City Department of Records & Information Services*. Image was ordered 4 Apr 2020 and received via email 19 Apr 2020 ([link to order-form](#)).

**RETURN OF A BIRTH.** 189963  
189963  
192

To the Bureau of Vital Statistics, Health Department,  
301 MOTT STREET, New York.

**RECEIVED**  
AUG 31 1876

1. Full Name of Child (if any), *Auguste Lehmann*  
2. Sex, *Female* No. of Child of Mother, *3*  
3. Race or Color, (if not of the white race.) *White*  
4. Date of Birth, *28 August 1876*  
5. Place of Birth, (Street and Number.) *95 St Lexington St.*  
6. Full Name of Mother, *Pauline Lehmann*  
(Maiden Name.) *Pauline Lux*  
7. Mother's Birthplace and Age, *Germany; Age 25*  
8. Mother's Residence, *95 St Lexington St.*  
9. Full Name of Father, *Gottlieb Lehmann*  
10. Father's Occupation, *Printer*  
11. Father's Birthplace and Age, *Germany, Age 27*  
Signature and Address of Medical Attendant,  
Name of Person who makes this Return, *Marie Bauer*  
Date of this Return, *30 August 1876*

*Quality of Evidence:*

|             |             |  |
|-------------|-------------|--|
| Source      | Original    | This is an image of Augusta's original birth return. It is a printed form filled in with handwritten information. The image quality is good and the penmanship is legible.   |
| Informant   | Marie Bauer | 'Marie Bauer' is shown as the person making the return. Her identity is unknown. Since the space for the medical attendant's signature is blank, and Augusta was born at home, Bauer may have been a midwife or birth attendant. |
| Information | Primary     | If Marie Bauer was present for Augusta's birth, she would have first-hand knowledge of the event.  |
| Reliability | Reliable    | This birth return is probably a reliable source since it was likely completed by a birth attendant and reported only two days later.   |
| Evidence    | Direct      | Parents - Gottlieb & Pauline Lehmann<br>Birth Date – 28 Aug 1876<br>Birth Place – New York City, New York, USA<br>Mother's Maiden Name – Pauline Lux   |

**Record of christening – Auguste Lehmann**

*Citation:*

"New York Births and Christenings, 1640-1962," database collection, *FamilySearch.org* ([familysearch.com link](https://www.familysearch.com) : viewed 4 Apr 2020), entry for Auguste Lehmann.

*Quality of Evidence:*

|             |              |  |
|-------------|--------------|--|
| Source      | Derivative   | This is an index so the record has been processed into a different form. The index entry for this record suggests it is a record of Auguste Lehmann's christening. However, the collection is described as "an index of records compiled from various sources," <sup>4</sup> so the record's exact nature is unknown. The actual record may be available at a Family History Center. When the Family History Centers reopen, after the COVID-16 closures, the record will be accessed and evaluated. |
| Informant   | Unknown      | Since the record may be of a christening, the informant may have been the priest, or one of Augusta's parents. But without knowing the record's actual nature, the informant is not known.   |
| Information | Undetermined | The informant is unknown, therefore the basis for the information is unknown.  |
| Reliability | Unknown      | The underlying record should be located and assessed.  |
| Evidence    | Direct       | Parents - Gottlieb Lehmann & Pauline Lux<br>Birth Date – 28 Aug 1876<br>Birth Place – Manhattan, New York, New York, USA   |

<sup>4</sup> "New York Births and Christenings – FamilySearch Historical Records," research wiki, *FamilySearch.org* ([familysearch.org link](https://www.familysearch.org) : accessed 15 Apr 2020).

**Marriage license and return – Frank Schwartz and Gusta [Augusta] Lehman**

*Citation:*

Porter County [Indiana], Circuit Court Clerk, “Marriage Record, Volume 11, Sept 1895-Jan 1899,” p. 23; image, “Indiana Marriages, 1811-2007,” online database, *FamilySearch.org* ([familysearch.org link](http://familysearch.org) : viewed 4 Apr 2020), entry for Frank Schwartz and Gusta [Augusta] C. Lehman. This marriage record consists of two recordings, the marriage license and the marriage return. The two recordings will be assessed separately.

Marriage License

*Quality of Evidence:*

|             |   |   |
|-------------|---|---|
| Source      | Original  | This is an image of the county clerk’s record of the marriage license as entered into his register. It is a printed page, in a bound book, filled in with handwritten information. All of the pages in this record book are stamped “Unofficial Record”, indicating that they are not to be used for legal or official purposes. The original license was probably given to the betrothed couple. However, Augusta and Frank’s license number is not recorded in the register, or any other couple’s for that matter. The register entries are made in chronological order. The image is clear and the penmanship is legible.   |
| Informant   | Augusta Lehman and Frank Schwartz   | Augusta and Frank probably applied for their marriage license in person.  |
| Information | Primary   | Augusta and Frank had first-hand knowledge of their names and the date.   |
| Reliability | Overall - reliable<br>Name – reliable<br><br>License date – reliable<br>Birth year/age - unreliable | Certainly Augusta and Frank would know their own names as well as the date their license was issued.<br>However, the clerk recorded Augusta’s name as ‘Gusta’. His writing is clearly a capital ‘G’, but did he mis-hear the name or mis-write it? It is likely that this misinterpretation of her name was a clerical error.<br>The license date of 27 Oct 1895 fits sequentially with the surrounding pages.<br><br>Written in superscript just after Augusta’s name is the number ‘19’. This could possibly be her age; however, a number like this does not appear on any other records, 20 before and 20 after, her license. Also, the section of the record where an oath regarding the bride’s age is blank. |
| Evidence    | Direct<br><br><br><br><br><br><br><br><br><br>Indirect  | Husband – Frank Schwartz<br>Name – Gusta [Augusta] C. Lehman<br>Birth year – 1876 (based on age=19)<br>Marriage Date – 27 Oct 1895 or after, based on the date the license was issued.<br><br>Place of marriage – Porter County, Indiana. If the license was issued in Porter County, Indiana, it is likely they were married there.  |

## Marriage Return

### Quality of Evidence:

|             |             |  |
|-------------|-------------|--|
| Source      | Original    | This is an image of the county clerk's record of Augusta and Frank's marriage return as entered into his register. The image is clear and the penmanship is legible. |
| Informant   | H. Eickhoff | H. Eickhoff is shown as the minister who performed Augusta and Frank's marriage.   |
| Information | Primary     | The minister would have attended the marriage. However, the return was not recorded until 16 Jan 1896, about 2 ½ months after the marriage.                          |
| Reliability | Reliable    | Even though the marriage return was not recorded for 2 ½ months, the event was likely to be fresh enough in the minister's mind to be accurate.                      |
| Evidence    | Direct      | Husband – Frank Schwartz<br>Name – Gusta C. Lehman<br>Date of Marriage – 30 Oct 1895   |

## Death Certificate – Augusta Schwartz

### Citation

Indiana State Board of Health, death certificate no. 185 (stamped) for Auguta [Augusta] Schwartz, database with images, "Indiana, Death Certificates, 1899-2011," *Ancestry.com* ([ancestry.com link](#) : viewed 7 Apr 2020); citing Indiana Archives and Records Administration, Indianapolis, "Death Certificates; Year 1910-1919."

### Quality of Evidence:

|             |                |  |
|-------------|----------------|--|
| Source      | Original       | This is an image of the Augusta's death certificate. It is a printed form filled in with handwritten information. The image is clear and the penmanship is legible, although the medical certification is a bit hard to decipher.  |
| Informant   | Frank Schwartz | Frank Schwartz is shown as the informant. However, it appears the form was filled out by the undertaker, C.W. Bartholomew, since the personal information is in his handwriting.   |
| Information | Primary        | Frank was likely to have been near Augusta during her final hours.   |
| Reliability | Reliable       | Augusta's death certificate contains several, what appear to be, spelling errors of peoples' names. It is possible that Frank gave the information verbally to the undertaker, and the undertaker either misheard or simply misspelled the names. In spite of the spelling errors, it is likely that the information on the certificate is reliable. |
| Evidence    | Direct         | Place of death – Valparaiso, Porter County, Indiana<br>Name – Auguta [Augusta] Schwartz<br>Date of death – 18 Sep 1914<br>Husband – Frank Schwartz<br>Date of Birth – 28 Aug 1876<br>Place of birth – New York State<br>Parents Names – Godlip [Gottlieb] Lehman and Poline [Pauline] Lutz [Lux]   |
|             | Other Info     | Date and Place of Burial – Sept 21, 1914 Graceland   |

## CENSUSES

### *Quality of Evidence:*

To save space, the evidence from these censuses have been plotted directly into the Analysis of Evidence table.

### **1900 United States Federal census – Frank Schwartz household (Frank, Augusta and children)**

#### *Citation:*

1900 U.S. census, Porter County, Indiana, Schedule 1. -Population, Washington Township, ED 93, p. 184 A (written), dwelling 115, family 114, Schwartz, Frank household; image *Ancestry.com* ([ancestry.com link](#)) : viewed 8 Apr 2020); citing NARA microfilm T623 roll 398.

### **1910 United States Federal census – Frank Schwartz household (Frank, Augusta and children)**

#### *Citation:*

1910 U.S. census, Porter County, Indiana, 1910 -Population, Washington Township, ED 151, p. 206 (stamped), dwelling 59, family 59, Schwartz, Frank household; image *Ancestry.com* ([ancestry.com link](#)) : viewed 8 Apr 2020); citing NARA microfilm T624 roll 374.

### **1920 United States Federal census – Frank Schwartz (a widowed man)**

#### *Citation:*

1920 U.S. census, Lake County, Indiana, 1920 -Population, Calumet Township, Gary City, ED 109, p. 17 (written) A (stamped), dwelling 262, family 334, Schwartz, Frank, roomer; image *Ancestry.com* ([ancestry.com link](#)) : viewed 10 Apr 2020); citing NARA microfilm T625 roll 446.

## NEWSPAPERS & OBITUARIES

### **Obituary – Frank Schwartz**

#### *Citation:*

“Funeral to be Held Here on Tuesday,” Frank Schwartz obituary, *Vidette-Messenger* [Valparaiso, Indiana], 7 Apr 1930, p. 4, col. 3.; image, *Newspapers.com* ([newspapers.com link](#)) : viewed 9 Apr 2020).



*Quality of Evidence:*

|             |                                   |   |
|-------------|-----------------------------------|---|
| Source      | Narrative                         | This is an image of the newspaper obituary for Frank Schwartz.  |
| Informant   | Child or sister of Frank Schwartz | The author of the obituary is unknown but it was probably based upon information given by one of Frank's children or his sister, all who are named in the obituary.   |
| Information | Primary & Secondary               | Frank's children and sister were likely to have been keenly aware of Augusta's death, so they would have been able to recall the date. They were primary witnesses even though the death was 29 years in the past. However, while Frank's sister may have been present at Augusta's wedding, her children were not. They may, however, have celebrated the anniversary with their parents and thus knew the date. |
| Reliability | Reliable                          | The information in Frank's obituary was probably accurately provided by his kin.  |
| Evidence    | Direct                            | Husband – Frank Schwartz<br>Name – Augusta Leahman [Lehman]<br>Date of Marriage – 30 Oct 1895<br>Date of Death – 18 Sep 1914  |

**WILLS & PROBATES**

**Will of Gottlieb Lehman**

*Citation:*

LaPorte County [Indiana], Circuit Court Clerk, "Will Record, Vol [unreadable H I or J], Feb 1913-Mar 1918," p. 143 (stamped); image, "Indiana, Wills and Probate Records, 1798-1999," online database, *Ancestry.com* ([ancestry.com link](https://www.ancestry.com) : viewed 1 Apr 2020), entry for Gottlieb Lehman; citing *Indiana County, District and Probate Courts*.

*Extracted Information:*

Will of Gottlieb Lehman dated 4 Oct 1911:  
Gottlieb Lehman left real property in LaPorte County Indiana to his two sons,  
Emil Lehman and Herman Lehman.  
These two sons were each to pay \$600 to each of Gottlieb's five daughters,  
Leana [Lena] Lehman, Ida Werner, Wanda Werner, Anna Dye, and Augusta Schwartz.  
Gottlieb Lehman died in LaPorte County, Indiana on 28 Feb 1914.

*Quality of Evidence:*

|             |                    |   |
|-------------|--------------------|---|
| Source      | Derivative         | This is an image of the LaPorte County clerk, Chris Bielefeldt's, typed transcription of Gottlieb Lehman's will into his record book. The image is clear except that several handwritten, perpendicular notes cover much of the area. However, the will is still readable underneath. The transcription is carefully typed with very few obvious typographical errors, cross-outs or typeovers. |
| Informant   | Gottlieb Lehman    | This is Gottlieb Lehman's will so he would be the informant.  |
| Information | Primary            | Gottlieb Lehman would have been knowledgeable about his children's names.   |
| Reliability | Reliable           | Gottlieb Lehman mentions each of his children by name, including the married name of his married daughters, with no mention of any other living children. It is reasonable that he would have only included living children in his will.  |
| Evidence    | Direct<br>Indirect | Name – Augusta Schwartz<br>Parent's Name – Gottlieb Lehman<br>Date of Death – After 4 Oct 1911  |

*Partial Transcript of notes on page one of Gottlieb Lehman's will:*

Rec'd March 2, 1915 of Chris J. Bielefeldt, Clerk La Porte Circuit Court Twelve hundred Dollars (\$1200<sup>00</sup>) in full of the within bequests made to Augusta Schwartz and ordered paid by Emil Lehman and Herman Lehman as per the bequests of the within will.

Frank Schwartz  
Administrator of the Estate of  
Augusta Lehman, deceased

*Quality of Evidence:*

|             |                    |   |
|-------------|--------------------|---|
| Source      | Derivative         | This is an image of handwritten notes made perpendicularly to the typewritten will of Gottlieb Lehman. These notes are in the handwriting of LaPorte County clerk, Chris Bielefeldt, so they are a transcription of Frank Schwartz's receipt of Augusta's inheritance. The image is clear and the handwriting is legible. |
| Informant   | Frank Schwartz     | In this note, Frank is reporting that Augusta is deceased so he is the informant.   |
| Information | Primary            | Frank would have first-hand knowledge about Augusta's death.  |
| Reliability | Reliable           |   |
| Evidence    | Direct<br>Indirect | Name – Augusta Schwartz<br>Date of Death – Before 2 Mar 1915  |